



schweizerische agentur
für akkreditierung
und qualitätssicherung

agence suisse
d'accréditation et
d'assurance qualité

agenzia svizzera di
accreditamento e
garanzia della qualità

swiss agency of
accreditation and
quality assurance

Accreditation pursuant to HEdA and MedPA Study programme in chiropractic medicine, University of Zurich

External evaluation report | 26.03.2021



Content:

Part A – Decision of the Swiss Accreditation Council

Part B – Accreditation pursuant to HEdA and MedPA and accreditation proposal of the AAQ

Part C – Expert report

Part D – Statement by the University of Zurich

Part E – Hearing of the Commission for Medical Professions



Part A

Decision of the Swiss Accreditation Council

26.03.2021



Entscheid
des Schweizerischen Akkreditierungsrats

Akkreditierung des Studiengangs

Chiropraktische Medizin

der Universität Zürich

I. Rechtliches

Bundesgesetz vom 30. September 2011 über die Förderung der Hochschulen und die Koordination im schweizerischen Hochschulbereich (Hochschulförderungs- und -koordinationsgesetz, HFKG), SR 414.20

Bundesgesetz vom 23. Juni 2006 über die universitären Medizinalberufe (Medizinalberufegesetz, MedBG), SR 811.11

Verordnung des Hochschulrates vom 28. Mai 2015 (Stand 1. Januar 2018) über die Akkreditierung im Hochschulbereich (Akkreditierungsverordnung HFKG), SR 414.205.3

Reglement vom 12. März 2015 über die Organisation des Schweizerischen Akkreditierungsrats (OReg-SAR)

II. Sachverhalt

Die Universität Zürich hat mit Schreiben vom 2. September 2019 ein Gesuch auf Programmakkreditierung des Studiengangs für Chiropraktische Medizin bei der Schweizerischen Agentur für Akkreditierung und Qualitätssicherung (AAQ) eingereicht.

Die AAQ hat den Schweizerischen Akkreditierungsrat über die vorgesehene Eröffnung des Verfahrens am 6. Dezember 2019 informiert.

Die von der AAQ eingesetzte Gutachtergruppe hat auf der Grundlage des Selbstbeurteilungsberichts des Departements für Chiropraktische Medizin vom 31. März 2020 und der Vor-Ort-Visite vom 15. und 16. Oktober 2020 an der Universität Zürich geprüft, ob die Qualitätsstandards nach HFKG und MedBG erfüllt sind, und einen entsprechenden Bericht verfasst (vorläufiger Bericht der Gutachtergruppe vom 27. November 2020).

Die AAQ hat gestützt auf die verfahrensrelevanten Unterlagen, insbesondere den Selbstbeurteilungsbericht und den vorläufigen Bericht der Gutachtergruppe, den Entwurf des Akkreditierungsantrags formuliert und der Universität Zürich am 30. November 2020 zur Stellungnahme vorgelegt.

Die Medizinische Fakultät der Universität Zürich hat am 8. Januar 2021 (Überarbeitung eines ersten Schreibens vom 28. Dezember 2020) zum Bericht der Gutachtergruppe und zum Akkreditierungsantrag der AAQ Stellung genommen.

Aufgrund der Stellungnahme der Medizinischen Fakultät der Universität Zürich hat die Gutachtergruppe mit Datum vom 12. Januar 2021 ihren definitiven Bericht vorgelegt. Die AAQ hat den Akkreditierungsantrag mit Datum vom 27. Januar 2021 fertiggestellt.

Die ausserparlamentarische Medizinalberufekommission (MEBEKO) hat am 9. Februar 2021 zum Akkreditierungsantrag der AAQ und dem Bericht der Gutachtergruppe Stellung genommen.

Die AAQ hat mit Schreiben vom 27. Januar 2021 beim Schweizerischen Akkreditierungsrat Antrag auf Akkreditierung des Studiengangs eingereicht.

III. Erwägungen

1. *Bewertung der Gutachtergruppe*

Auf der Grundlage der Analyse aller Standards nach HFKG und MedBG stellt die Gutachtergruppe dem Studiengang Chiropraktische Medizin der Universität Zürich in ihrem Bericht (Dokumentation AAQ, Teil C) ein gutes Zeugnis aus. Besonders hervorgehoben wird das hohe Engagement von Personal und Studierenden. Ebenfalls positiv vermerkt werden die sich durch die Kombination mit dem Bachelor- und Masterprogramm in Humanmedizin ergebenden Synergien, welche es den Studierenden der Chiropraktischen Medizin erlauben, sich ein vertieftes Wissen anzueignen.

Auf der Ebene der Führung wird hingegen festgestellt, dass der vakante Lehrstuhl für Chiropraktische Medizin möglichst bald besetzt werden sollte. Ausserdem soll die Nachfolge des *Head of Study Programme* frühzeitig geplant werden.

Mit Blick auf die Integration des Studiengangs bzw. des Departements Chiropraktische Medizin in die Medizinische Fakultät und deren Studiengang Humanmedizin, stellt die Gutachtergruppe fest, dass der Standard 4.02 («Das Studienprogramm ist ein integraler Bestandteil des Qualitätssicherungssystems der höheren Bildungsinstitution oder anderen Institution im Umfeld/ Sektor der höheren Bildung») nur teilweise erfüllt ist, da die Chiropraktische Medizin nicht in der Lehrkommission («Teaching Commission») vertreten ist. Die Gutachtergruppe schlägt deshalb eine Auflage vor:

Auflage 1 (zu Standard 4.02)

Ein Vertreter des Departements für Chiropraktische Medizin muss formal (nicht auf freiwilliger Basis) in der Lehrkommission und den monatlichen Sitzungen der Studiendekane vertreten sein.

Auf der Grundlage des Selbstbeurteilungsberichts des Departements Chiropraktische Medizin der Universität Zürich und der Vor-Ort-Visite empfiehlt die Gutachtergruppe, die Akkreditierung des Studiengangs Chiropraktische Medizin der Universität Zürich mit einer Auflage auszusprechen.

2. *Stellungnahme der Medizinischen Fakultät der Universität Zürich*

Nach Konsultation mit der AAQ hat die Medizinische Fakultät der Universität Zürich entschieden, ihre Stellungnahme vom 28. Dezember 2020 nochmals zu überarbeiten und legte am 8. Januar 2021 die definitive Stellungnahme vor.

In der definitiven Stellungnahme hält die Medizinische Fakultät der Universität Zürich fest, wie sie die einzelnen Empfehlungen der Expertengruppe und der AAQ implementieren möchte (vgl. Stellungnahme in Teil D).

Die Medizinische Fakultät hält zudem fest, dass der Expertenbericht stellenweise sehr harsch formuliert sei. Dies bezieht sich insbesondere auf den Vorwurf, die Selbstevaluation sei „*poorly written*“ und „*repetitive*“ gewesen. Einerseits habe die AAQ explizit einen ausführlichen Bericht über den ganzen Studienverlauf, inklusive vier Jahre Medizinische Ausbildung verlangt, andererseits habe man sich als Basis zu einem grossen Teil auf die Selbstevaluation in Humanmedizin von 2018 verlassen müssen.

Im Weiteren zeigt die Stellungnahme auf, wie die Medizinische Fakultät die Auflage erfüllen will.

3. *Akkreditierungsantrag der AAQ*

Die AAQ hält in ihrem Akkreditierungsantrag fest, dass die Analyse der Gutachtergruppe sich auf alle Standards bezieht und ihre Schlussfolgerungen nachvollziehbar sind.

In ihrem Akkreditierungsantrag an den Akkreditierungsrat übernimmt die AAQ die Empfehlungen der Gutachtergruppe und beantragt unter Berücksichtigung der obigen Erwägungen und gestützt auf:

- den Selbstbeurteilungsbericht des Studiengangs Chiropraktische Medizin
- den Bericht der Gutachtergruppe
- die Stellungnahme der medizinischen Fakultät und des Departements für Chiropraktische Medizin der Universität Zürich

die Akkreditierung des Studiengangs Chiropraktische Medizin der Universität Zürich mit einer Auflage:

Auflage 1 (zu Standard 4.02)

Ein Vertreter des Departments für Chiropraktische Medizin muss formal (nicht auf freiwilliger Basis) in der Lehrkommission und den monatlichen Sitzungen der Studiendekane vertreten sein.

Die AAQ hält eine Frist von 12 Monaten zur Erfüllung der Auflage für angemessen.

Die AAQ schlägt vor, die Auflagenerfüllung «sur dossier» selbst zu überprüfen.

4. *Stellungnahme der MEBEKO*

Die Medizinalberufekommission MEBEKO, Ressort Ausbildung stellt fest, dass das Akkreditierungsverfahren des Studienganges Chiropraktische Medizin nach den geltenden Rechtsgrundlagen und Standards durchgeführt worden ist.

Sie nimmt den Bericht der AAQ zur externen Evaluation zustimmend zur Kenntnis und befürwortet den Akkreditierungsantrag der AAQ, die Akkreditierung des Studiengangs Chiropraktische Medizin der Universität Zürich mit einer Auflage auszusprechen.

5. *Beurteilung des Schweizerischen Akkreditierungsrats*

Der Bericht der Gutachtergruppe und der Akkreditierungsantrag der AAQ sind vollständig und stichhaltig begründet. Sie ermöglichen es dem Akkreditierungsrat, einen Entscheid zu fällen.

Aus dem Akkreditierungsantrag der AAQ geht angemessen hervor, dass der Studiengang Chiropraktische Medizin der Universität Zürich die Standards für die Programmakkreditierung nach HFKG und MedBG erfüllt.

IV. Entscheid

Gestützt auf die Rechtsgrundlagen, den Sachverhalt und die Erwägungen entscheidet der Akkreditierungsrat:

1. Der Schweizerische Akkreditierungsrat stellt fest, dass das Verfahren der institutionellen Akkreditierung gemäss den Vorgaben des HFKG, der Akkreditierungsverordnung HFKG und gemäss Vorgaben des MedBG durchgeführt wurde.
2. Der Schweizerische Akkreditierungsrat stellt fest, dass die vorliegende Dokumentation geeignet ist einen Entscheid zu treffen.
3. Der Schweizerische Akkreditierungsrat spricht die Akkreditierung des Studiengangs Chiropraktische Medizin der Universität Zürich mit einer Auflage aus:
 - 3.1 Auflage 1 (zu Standard 4.02)
Ein Vertreter des Departments für Chiropraktische Medizin muss formal (nicht auf freiwilliger Basis) in der Lehrkommission und den monatlichen Sitzungen der Studiendekane vertreten sein.
4. Die Akkreditierung wird für eine Dauer von sieben Jahren ab dem Datum dieses Entscheids, d.h. bis zum 25.03.2028 erteilt.
5. Die Akkreditierung wird in elektronischer Form auf www.akkreditierungsrat.ch veröffentlicht.
6. Der Schweizerische Akkreditierungsrat stellt dem Studiengang eine Urkunde aus.
7. Der Schweizerische Akkreditierungsrat vergibt das Siegel „Studiengang akkreditiert nach HFKG & MedBG“.

Bern, 26.03.2021

Präsident des Schweizerischen
Akkreditierungsrats



Prof. Dr. Jean-Marc Rapp

Rechtsmittelbelehrung:

Gegen diese Verfügung kann innert 30 Tagen nach der Eröffnung beim Bundesverwaltungsgericht, Postfach, 9023 St. Gallen Beschwerde geführt werden.



Part B

Accreditation pursuant to HEdA and MedPA and accreditation proposal of the AAQ

12.01.2021



Contents

1	Legal principles, objective and object of accreditation	1
2	Procedure	1
2.1	Expert group.....	1
2.2	Calendar.....	2
2.3	Self-assessment report	2
2.4	On-site visit	3
2.5	Expert report	3
2.6	Statement of the Medical Faculty of the University of Zurich	3
3	Accreditation proposal of the Swiss Agency of Accreditation and Quality Assurance	3

1 Legal principles, objective and object of accreditation

Medical training is regulated by the Medical Professions Act (MedPA). In order for a study programme to lead to a Swiss federal diploma (Art. 24 MedPA), it must be accredited in accordance with Art. 31 Higher Education Act (HEdA). Upon registration for the federal examination, candidates must produce evidence of accreditation for the completed study programme. Accreditation in the university medical professions is carried out within the framework of programme accreditation pursuant to HEdA, whereby the HEdA quality standards are supplemented by the MedPA quality standards.

HEdA and MedPA differ in terms of the object of accreditation. HEdA focuses on Bologna-compliant programmes of study, i.e. bachelor's and master's degrees are considered individually. MedPA focuses on the six-year training for a medical profession pursuant to Art. 2 MedPA, i.e. study programmes pursuant to MedPA. As MedPA insists on the accreditation of university medical training courses, the term 'study programme' is used in the following sections.

As a prerequisite for accreditation, MedPA stipulates that graduates of the study programme must attain all of the objectives set out by MedPA and thus qualify for postgraduate education (Art. 24 (1) MedPA). All the objectives – i.e. the general objectives, the objectives specific to the profession and the qualification for postgraduate education – cannot be assumed to have been attained until the six-year training course has been completed. Within the framework of accreditation, it is not possible to extrapolate sub-objectives for, for example, the first three years (bachelor's programme) from the criteria for accreditation pursuant to MedPA. Programme accreditation pursuant to HEdA and MedPA covers the entire six-year training course leading to a Swiss federal diploma (Art. 23 (1) MedPA) (study programme as defined by MedPA).

The object of the accreditation procedure is the combination of bachelor's and master's programmes within the framework of which the training for a medical profession pursuant to Art. 2 MedPA is carried out. The starting point for accreditation is the respective master's programme of the university that awards the title. As part of the accreditation procedure (self-evaluation of the quality standards in the self-assessment report), the university awarding the title must explain how it ensures that students meet the criteria for admission at the beginning of a study programme (i.e. duly qualified bachelor's degree holders) under the terms of Art. 24 (1) MedPA.

2 Procedure

This procedure has been conducted in order to prepare for the accreditation of the study programme in chiropractic medicine at the University of Zurich.

2.1 Expert group

In a first step, the AAQ agreed on a profile of the expert group with the Department of Chiropractic Medicine (Clinic for Chiropractic Medicine at Balgrist University Hospital) within the Medical Faculty of the University of Zurich for the selection of the expert group. Based on this profile, a so-called longlist of possible reviewers was created. The longlist was approved by the AAQ Commission on 6 December 2019. From this longlist, the AAQ compiled the following expert group and informed the University of Zurich about it in an e-mail dated 23 January 2020 (in alphabetical order)

- Maria Browning, BSc (Chiro), DC, MSc (Chiro. Paeds), Cert MEd – Deputy Director of Clinic, AECC University College
- Prof. Martin Fischer, MME, Institut für Didaktik und Ausbildungsforschung in der Medizin, Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München
- Prof. Henrik Hein Lauridsen, Chiropractor, MSc (rehabilitation), PhD, University of Southern Denmark (peer leader)
- Alina Mertens, Student AECC University College

2.2 Calendar

The timetable was determined in consultation with the Department of Chiropractic Medicine within the Medical Faculty of the University of Zurich:

06.12.2019	Date of admission
29.08.2019	Opening meeting of the accreditation procedure
18.03.2020	Meeting to plan the on-site visit
31.03.2020	Closing date self-evaluation report
15-16.10.2020	On-site visit (due to corona, an online visit was conducted)
27.11.2020	First version of the experts' report and the accreditation proposal of the AAQ
08.01.2021	Statement of the University of Zurich
12.01.2021	Final version of the experts' report and the accreditation proposal of the AAQ
09.02.2021	Hearing of the Commission for Medical Professions
26.03.2021	Decision by the Swiss Accreditation Council
XX	Publication of external evaluation report (website AAQ)

2.3 Self-assessment report

The Department of Chiropractic Medicine submitted its self-assessment report to the AAQ on 31 March 2020, as agreed.

The self-assessment phase was led by a steering group on the department side, which also provided the authors of the report. The members of the steering group were the Head of Study Programme and Policlinic for Chiropractic Medicine, the Chair ad interim Chiropractic Medicine, the Curriculum Director, the Directors of the Policlinic, the Director of Research, the Co-Presidents of Swiss Chiropractic Students SCS and student representatives. The Faculty Board adopted the self-evaluation report at its meeting on 18 March 2020.

The self-evaluation report includes a presentation of the University of Zurich, its Faculty of Medicine and the study programme in chiropractic medicine, information on the self-assessment process and how the results of the last accreditation procedure were handled.

In the main body of the self-assessment report, the Department of Chiropractic Medicine analyses its own degree of compliance with the quality standards. It describes the facts of each

standard and then draws a conclusion. Based on this, the Department of Chiropractic Medicine has drawn up an action plan for the further development of the programme and its quality assurance system.

The expert group found that the self-assessment report did not provide an ideal starting point: the self-evaluation report was in part poorly written, contained much repetition, provided little meaningful information on the study programme in chiropractic medicine, did not always refer to the standards, and essential appendices such as the curriculum for Year 5 and Year 6 were missing.

2.4 On-site visit

Due to the coronavirus pandemic, it was decided – in mutual agreement – to conduct the on-site visit virtually via 'Zoom'. The visit took place as planned during one and a half days from Thursday 15 October to Friday 16 October 2020. The experts had the opportunity to deepen the findings of the self-assessment report in discussions with all stakeholders of the programme. The atmosphere of the discussions was constructive and open.

The visit was concluded with the so-called debriefing, where the expert group shared its general impression of the study programme in chiropractic medicine with representatives of the Department of Chiropractic Medicine and members of the Faculty of Medicine.

2.5 Expert report

The report of the expert group, which was submitted on time, contains a thorough analysis of the degree of fulfilment of all quality standards. The report was submitted to the Faculty of Medicine of the University of Zurich together with the accreditation proposition of the AAQ for comments on 30 November 2020.

2.6 Statement of the Medical Faculty of the University of Zurich

The Medical Faculty of the University of Zurich handed in its statement on time on 28 December 2020. After consultation with the AAQ, the Medical Faculty decided to rewrite its statement and handed in the version pictured in Part D of this report on 8 January 2021.

In its statement, the Medical Faculty already explains how it plans to meet the condition that is proposed by the expert group and the AAQ.

According to the rules of a programme accreditation according to HEdA and MedPA laid down in the HEdA Accreditation Ordinance, the verification whether a condition has been met is carried out after the Swiss Accreditation Council has made its accreditation decision and has decided on the means and the deadline in which the condition has to be met.

The Medical Faculty also comments on the tone of the expert report, that it perceives to be 'rather harsh' in parts.

3 Accreditation proposal of the Swiss Agency of Accreditation and Quality Assurance

Background

The study programme in chiropractic medicine at the University of Zurich is the only study programme in chiropractic medicine in Switzerland. There has been a steady increase in the number of places to study. By 2020, 24 places were on offer. Students who have completed the Master's in Chiropractic Medicine (M Chiro Med) are allowed to take the federal examination in chiropractic medicine, which is itself the prerequisite to enter the postgraduate education

programme in chiropractic medicine. According to MedPA, only the successful completion of the postgraduate education programme in chiropractic medicine gives permission to practice as a chiropractor in Switzerland in a private office.

In the last cycle of accreditation in 2014, the accreditation of the study programme in chiropractic medicine was subject to conditions regarding resources, infrastructure and governance. The Bachelor's in Human Medicine of the University of Zurich has already been a part of the subject of an accreditation procedure in the current cycle, namely the accreditation of the study programme in human medicine of the University of Zurich. The Swiss Accreditation Council granted accreditation without any conditions on 22 March 2019.

The curriculum of the study programme in chiropractic medicine has a strong foundation in human medicine. Year 1 to Year 4 consists mainly of the curriculum of the study programme in human medicine, with the exception of the mantle studies, a compulsory elective for students of human medicine. Students enrolled in chiropractic medicine have to attend the mantle studies' modules in chiropractic medicine. After Year 3, all students will obtain a Bachelor's in Human Medicine (BMed).

The curriculum of Year 5 and Year 6 is the sole responsibility of the study programme in chiropractic medicine. Year 5 consists of the teaching of chiropractic examination and treatment and Year 6 consists of working in the Policlinic for Chiropractic Medicine at Balgrist University Hospital and as an underassistant in rotations in Orthopaedics, Rheumatology, Neurology, Internal Medicine and Radiology. During Year 4, 5 and 6, students also write their master's thesis.

The Medical Faculty of the University of Zurich applies for reaccreditation of the study programme in chiropractic medicine for another accreditation period of 7 years.

Considerations

According to the expert group, the combination of a Bachelor's in Human Medicine and a Master's in Chiropractic Medicine is ideal as it presents an integration of human and chiropractic medicine that allows students to have a sound scientific knowledge and understanding of human medicine and gives them the capacity to build their knowledge and practical skills in chiropractic medicine upon this. To maintain the curriculum's high level, the expert group makes a recommendation on the implementation of the new learning catalogue PROFILES. They also make a recommendation concerning complementary medicine.

The expert group underlines the high commitment to the study programme by both staff and students, even though the workload for staff and students alike is comparatively high. Furthermore, the experts highlight the various possibilities for students to gain practical experience throughout the study programme. The expert group makes a positive comment on the research that has been carried out by the department.

Concerning governance, the expert group notes that the vacant position of Chair of Chiropractic Medicine should be filled as soon as possible and that the succession for the position of the Head of Study Programme and Policlinic for Chiropractic Medicine should be planned. The experts make a recommendation on this matter.

The expert group encourages the study programme to plan its resources carefully so that in the future, as intended, full cohorts of 24 students per year can graduate. The expert group also makes a recommendation on this matter. Another recommendation of the expert group concerns the alignment of learning objectives, teaching strategies and assessment methods.

The expert group furthermore recommends that the Faculty of Human Medicine and the Department of Chiropractic Medicine together evaluate all six years of the study programme in

chiropractic medicine regularly. The collaboration of the Faculty of Human Medicine and the Department of Chiropractic Medicine is also the subject of the only condition that the expert group pronounces. The expert group judges the following quality standard as partially fulfilled.

- Standard 4.02: The study programme is an integral component of the quality assurance system of the higher education institution or other institution within the higher education sector.

In view of the fact that the curriculum consists of an integration of human and chiropractic medicine, the expert group considers it necessary that a representative of the staff of chiropractic medicine be included in the Teaching Commission and in the regular meetings of the study deans.

The expert group's analysis takes into account all relevant parts of the quality standards. The expert group's explanations and judgement are consistent and coherent.

Proposal

On the basis of the self-assessment report of the study programme in chiropractic medicine of the University of Zurich dated 31 March 2020, the expert report of 12 January 2021, the statement of the study programme in chiropractic medicine of the University of Zurich of 8 January 2021 and the above considerations, the Swiss Agency of Accreditation and Quality Assurance (AAQ) proposes that accreditation of the study programme in chiropractic medicine of the University of Zurich is subject to the following condition.

- A representative of the Department of Chiropractic Medicine must be formally integrated (not on a voluntary basis) into the Teaching Commission and the monthly meetings of the study deans.

The AAQ considers 12 months to be a reasonable period for the condition to be met.

The AAQ proposes to have the condition assessed 'sur dossier' (in writing) by the agency itself.



Part C
Expert report

12.01.2021



Content

1	Study programme in chiropractic medicine of the University of Zurich	1
2	Analysis of the conformity of the study programme with the quality standards	3
3	Overall appraisal and strengths/weaknesses profile of the study programme.....	26
4	Recommendations for the development of the study programme	27
5	Accreditation proposal of the expert panel.....	27

1 Study programme in chiropractic medicine of the University of Zurich

Portrait

Currently, around 3,400 students and doctoral candidates are enrolled at the Faculty of Medicine of the University of Zurich. This makes it the largest medical faculty in Switzerland. More than 60 institutes and clinics belong to the Faculty of Medicine, five research centres and seven competence centres are run by it, and it is contractually associated with six institutes. In the area of study and teaching, the faculty is responsible for the study programmes in human medicine, chiropractic medicine and dental medicine. For the clinical part of the training, the Faculty of Medicine cooperates with approximately 30 clinics and psychiatric services within and outside the Canton of Zurich.

According to the 2011-2015 legislative goals of the Government Council of the Canton of Zurich, university medicine in Zurich should be further strengthened, which is why a new governance was established. A coordination committee was established, in which members of the University of Zurich, university hospitals and ETH Zurich are represented. University Medicine Zurich is managed by a Board of Directors, whose Director has been in office since August 2018 and who, by virtue of her function, is a member of the overall management of the University of Zurich. The Director of University Medicine Zurich is responsible for the coordination and operational management of the Zurich University Medical Network.

The Faculty of Medicine was able to almost double its number of study places over the last ten years and currently offers almost 400 study places. Since 2008, 20 study places have been reserved for students of chiropractic medicine. This number was increased to 22 in 2018, and to 24 study places in 2019.

Structure of the study programme

The Faculty of Medicine at Zurich University and the Clinic for Chiropractic Medicine at Balgrist University Hospital (in the following: Department of Chiropractic Medicine) are responsible for the study programme in chiropractic medicine. The study programme in chiropractic medicine had its first intake of students in September 2008, the first cohort of students graduated in 2014. The curriculum is divided into a bachelor's (180 ECTS) and a master's (180 ECTS) programme of three years each. The LOCES (LEARNING OBJECTIVES for CHIROPRACTIC EDUCATION in SWITZERLAND) currently defines the competencies of the programme (outcomes). In recent years, the LOCES has been further developed and the new reference document 'Principle Relevant Objectives and Framework for Integrated Learnings and Education in Switzerland' PROFILES now defines the final competences students must acquire. Since 2018, PROFILES has been gradually implemented in university education (master's programme) and will be relevant for the first time in 2022 for the federal chiropractic examination. A revaluation of the learning objectives, including an effort towards curriculum mapping within the framework of the implementation of PROFILES, is planned for 2022. Graduates of the study programme in chiropractic medicine are expected to have acquired the knowledge, skills and attitudes necessary to pass the federal examination in chiropractic medicine and are expected to be able to engage in safe, competent and effective practice under the supervision of an accredited chiropractor.

Students of chiropractic medicine at the University of Zurich enter their course of study with the same entrance requirements as students in human medicine. They fully complete the first four years of human medical studies earning a Bachelor's degree in Human Medicine after the completion of the third year. In addition, they are required to complete a total of 27 ECTS or 810 hours of lectures and practical courses in chiropractic medicine in these four years. Year 5 and 6 of the chiropractic medicine study programme are separate and distinct from the course of

study in human medicine. In Year 5, a heavy emphasis is placed on teaching the pathophysiology, diagnosis and treatment of neuromusculoskeletal diseases. In Year 6, the students complete a mandatory 11-month clinical internship ('Unterassistenz'), of which 5 months are spent rotating through various departments of Balgrist University Hospital and 6 months in the Policlinic for Chiropractic Medicine.

The master's degree is the prerequisite for admission to the federal examination in chiropractic medicine, which, if successfully passed, entitles the holder to enter into the chiropractic post-graduate programme. A (facultative) doctoral thesis can be submitted at the earliest one year after the master's degree. After its recognition by the Medical Faculty, the title of Doctor of Chiropractic Medicine (Dr. med. chiro.) is awarded.



Figure 1 : Curriculum overview study programme in chiropractic medicine

The Master's degree (M Chiro Med) in Chiropractic Medicine follows on from a foundation of basic and human sciences in Year 1, the healthy human in Year 2 and human illness and disease in Year 3 of the Bachelor of Medicine (B Med) curriculum.

Year 1 M Chiro Med integrates Clinical Medicine II (continuation of Medicine I) with the fundamental knowledge and skills necessary for the competent diagnosis and treatment of patients in chiropractic practice. These include clinical examination, differential diagnosis, manual treatments and active rehabilitation. During Year 3 of the M Chiro Med, students must also complete a master's research project. Students are expected to begin work on their project during this year.

Year 2 M Chiro Med focuses on the management of chiropractic patients in terms of safe, competent and evidence-informed best practice. The diagnostic and therapeutic knowledge and skills developed in Year 1 M Chiro Med are further developed and integrated into an overall management strategy appropriate for the most common types of patients that present to chiropractors.

Year 3 M Chiro Med is made up of two main components: one half of the year is spent in a chiropractic teaching clinic and the other half of the year is spent in medical internship with clinical rotations. The chiropractic teaching clinic focuses on applying the diagnostic, therapeutic and management knowledge and skills learned in the previous years on patients. Students will diagnose, treat and manage patients under the supervision of qualified chiropractors. During the five-month internship ('Unterassistentz'), students expand their clinical knowledge and skills through rotations in various departments such as Orthopaedics, Rheumatology, Neurology, Internal Medicine and Radiology.

Follow-up on the results of previous procedures

In the last accreditation procedure, the study programme in chiropractic medicine of the University of Zurich was accredited with five conditions. The requirements concerned different aspects such as strategic planning, human resources, facilities relating to the chiropractic provision in order to allow an appropriate implementation for clinical learning and training, a transparent budget review process and the visibility of the Department of Chiropractic Medicine within the organisational structure of the Faculty of Medicine. The conditions were fulfilled by the Faculty of Medicine in due time and the Swiss Accreditation Council confirmed that the requirements for the study programme of chiropractic medicine of the University of Zurich have been met at its meeting on 4 March 2016. The Faculty of Medicine implemented some of the recommendations on quality improvement suggested by the expert group at that time. This included the expansion of focus group discussions, the establishment of a teaching credit for innovative educational projects at the University of Zurich and the development of funding programmes for the improved compatibility of clinical tasks and research activities.

2 Analysis of the conformity of the study programme with the quality standards

1st area: Educational objectives

Standard 1.01:

The study programme has clear objectives, clarifying its special features and complying with national and international requirements.

Description

The study programme in chiropractic medicine uses the national catalogue of learning objectives LOCES I and, since 2018, PROFILES. Based on these learning catalogues, the Faculty of Medicine and the Department of Chiropractic Medicine have set educational goals for

each academic year, which in turn are differentiated into learning goals per module and thematic block. Most clinical courses have specific learning objectives. The programme is science based and structured accordingly. In mantle studies ('Mantelstudium'), the chiropractic medicine students are required to take the chiropractic 'elective' courses. Within the study programme in chiropractic medicine, the chiropractic courses are taken as 'options' in addition to the core human medicine lectures and clinical courses. As these 'options' are mandatory, there is no space within the curriculum for chiropractic students to take any further electives.

Analysis

The expert group notes that, based on the national catalogue of learning objectives, differentiated learning objectives have been drawn up that are adapted to the academic year and are further specified for the respective thematic blocks. The expert group further determined that the contents of Years 1 to 4 are the sole responsibility of the Faculty of Medicine, whereas the contents of Years 5 and 6, including the mantle studies ('Mantelstudium') for chiropractic medicine in Years 1 to 4, are the responsibility of the Department of Chiropractic Medicine. Currently, there is no formalised collaboration between the two main departments responsible for the study programmes in human medicine and chiropractic medicine (see also standard 4.02).

Since LOCES I is used as a basis and PROFILES is gradually being implemented, the national and international requirements are fulfilled. In the opinion of the expert group, the special feature of the programme is the strong science-based nature of the curriculum and the strong focus on clinical education and practice. In the opinion of the expert group, these special features are clearly reflected in the learning objectives.

The expert group rates quality standard 1.01 as completely fulfilled.

Standard 1.02:

The study programme pursues educational objectives in line with the mission and strategic planning of the higher education institution or other institution within the higher education sector.

Description

In 2012, the University of Zurich defined the strategic goals 2020. One of these goals concerns the area of 'university medicine', for which specific sub-goals have been defined. These include the role in the strategic planning of medical research and teaching, the coordination of goals and processes among all partners (the university hospitals and the ETH), the adaptation of management structures to the requirements of competitive university medicine, and the transparent and performance-oriented allocation of funds for research and teaching. The mission statement of the Medical Faculty takes up these developments as follows: The aim is to prepare students as well as possible for the federal examination and to strengthen the area of interprofessionalism and specific content priorities – the promotion of scientific thinking and research competencies above all.

Analysis

On the basis of the discussions held during the visit, the expert group came to the conclusion that the developments in the field of medicine initiated by the university management in the strategy for the university as a whole are recognised by all interest groups of the study programme in chiropractic medicine; the translation of the strategic goals at university level into the educational goals of the chiropractic study programme is working.

The expert group rates quality standard 1.02 as completely fulfilled.

Standard 1.03:

The tertiary-level type A institution, if applicable the institutions, regulate the study programme for earning a federal diploma in accordance with the objectives set out in the Medical Professions Act. The responsibility for the quality as well as the accreditation of the study programme lies with the institution that awards the master diploma.

The study programme enables the graduates – at the appropriate level over the course of their university medical education – to:

a) provide comprehensive, individual and high-quality treatment to patients;

Description

The University of Zurich uses LOCES I and, since 2018, PROFILES in its study programme of chiropractic medicine. These catalogues were developed by a working group under a mandate of the Federal Office of Public Health, ChiroSuisse and the Department of Chiropractic Medicine within the Faculty of Medicine of the University of Zurich. The University of Zurich awards the master's degree (M Chiro Med) to graduates of the study programme in chiropractic medicine and is therefore responsible for the quality of this study programme.

With regard to the demand for comprehensive, high-quality and individual patient care, the expert group was able to establish, on the basis of the self-assessment report and during the visit, that the University of Zurich conducts patient-related teaching in the study programme of chiropractic medicine primarily in clinical courses in hospitals and in small groups, by individual tutorials in chiropractic medicine, during events on the topic of communication in the field of psychosocial medicine (including acting patients), as well as in the Skills Lab.

Analysis

The chiropractic students start developing their patient handling skills during the mantle studies ('Mantelstudium') beginning with Year 1 (of the B Med programme) and further develop these skills longitudinally throughout the whole study programme. The clinical year (Year 6) with its clinical rotation through various departments gives the students a wide exposure to patients and to many clinical conditions and allows them to further develop their individual skills for high-quality patient treatment. The expert group concludes from this that the students of the study programme in chiropractic medicine are certainly qualified to provide patient care as required by Standard 1.03a.

The expert group rates quality standard 1.03a as completely fulfilled.

Standard 1.03b) address questions with scientifically recognised methods and in consideration of ethical and economic aspects, and make appropriate decisions on that basis;

Description

The study programme in chiropractic medicine at the University of Zurich is science based. Students receive a sound scientific introduction in the pre-clinical years, which they can then apply in the clinical year. One of the basic aims of the Medical Faculty of the University of Zurich and the Department of Chiropractic Medicine is to provide chiropractic students with the skills and abilities they need to make balanced clinical decisions in professional life. The biopsychosocial model with medical ethics, behavioural and social sciences is pursued throughout Years 1 to 4 of the chiropractic study programme; students follow lectures as well as practical courses. Year 4 addresses the psychosocial and ethical issues regarding specific health problems covered within the different lecture blocks. In addition to the courses with specific contents (scientific principles of medical decision making, evidence-based medicine or ethical case seminars), the courses in Year 5 in particular combine scientific principles, ethics

and cost effectiveness. In Year 6, the emergence and avoidance of cognitive errors in diagnosis are also discussed using real-life examples experienced during the clinical year.

Analysis

The expert group notes that chiropractic students can acquire sound basic scientific knowledge that underpins the entire study programme. This knowledge is deepened in various modules and lectures. The students, especially in Year 6 (clinical year), are also given the opportunity to apply this knowledge and to make appropriate decisions, taking into account the various relevant aspects. Thirdly, at the end of their studies, students can reflect on the experience they have gained by discussing various sub-aspects of the decisions taken.

The expert group rates quality standard 1.03b as completely fulfilled.

Standard 1.03c) communicate with patients and other involved parties in a professional and direct manner;

Description

Communication is taught and practised in various courses, which are based on miscellaneous topics, in all academic years (e.g. teaching in general practitioner medicine as well as in social and preventive medicine also includes communication skills such as telephone counselling, smoking cessation, vaccination counselling). The formal communication-related curriculum at the UZH comprises a total of 87 hours. Of these, 38 hours take place in small groups (three to nine students). The teaching of further communication-related learning content is variable in scope and takes place in clinical courses, partly explicitly and partly within the framework of the medical role model (depending on patient and discipline). The handling of complex communication situations with patients, relatives and in a team is the subject of an important workshop in Year 6 of the study programme, which is held by a psychologist. Furthermore, problems are discussed individually and in group settings in the student clinic.

Analysis

Based on the self-assessment report and the discussions during the visit, the expert group notes that the topic of communication is introduced early in the study programme and continuously deepened in various forms.

The expert group rates quality standard 1.03c as completely fulfilled.

Standard 1.03d) assume responsibility in the healthcare system, in particular in the field of primary medical care, and in their chosen profession in society;

Description

Primary medical care is the subject of various lectures. Specific lecture blocks take place in Year 1, Year 4 and Year 5 (paediatrics and geriatrics) and practical clinical courses, including an individual tutorial in family practices, in Year 3 and Year 4. The individual tutorials 'Family Medicine' take place in Year 3. Finally, some clinical courses specifically involve outpatients, for example, in internal medicine, dermatology, paediatrics, ORL/HNO, and, of course, chiropractic medicine. In addition, topics of health prevention are addressed during Year 6 of the study programme.

Analysis

The expert group notes that basic medical care or family medicine is the subject of several lectures and practical courses as well as individual tutorials throughout the study programme. The expert group concludes that the requirements of Standard 1.03d are fully met.

The expert group rates quality standard 1.03d as completely fulfilled.

Standard 1.03e) perform organisational and management tasks within the context of their profession;

Description

Organisational and management tasks are becoming increasingly important for medical vocational training. In the clinical year (Year 6), students are primarily confronted with such tasks in a clinical context. Two years ago, the Medical Faculty therefore introduced an 'Introductory Module' (Year 4) that prepares students for the tasks in the clinical year and gives advice on how they can benefit as much as possible from their experiences in the clinical year. In the chiropractic-specific curriculum, the course 'Introduction to clinical practice' in Year 5, where actual patient visits take place, and the introduction week before the work in the policlinic starts (Year 6) prepare the students for the challenge of organisational and managerial tasks.

Analysis

The expert group notes that students are basically given the ability to cope with organisational and management tasks by means of various courses. Through the implementation of PROFILES, this topic will be anchored even more explicitly in the curriculum in future, which was positively acknowledged by the expert group.

The expert group rates quality standard 1.03e as completely fulfilled.

Standard 1.03f) respect the competencies of other recognised healthcare professions;

Description

The need for good interprofessional cooperation has been recognised by the Medical Faculty as well as the Department of Chiropractic Medicine, and practical interprofessional training modules (e. g. 'Emergency Medicine', 'Interprofessional Communication Processes – Complex Conversational Situations with Patients', 'Introduction to OP Hygiene') have therefore been developed. In addition, the Medical Faculty of the University of Zurich has established a Vice-Dean's Office of Interprofessionalism with the aim of achieving greater interdependence in this area.

Analysis

The expert group notes that interprofessional courses have already been successfully established in cooperation with all participating educational institutions and will be further developed, practically tested and evaluated step by step. In addition, the expert group points out that the work of a chiropractor is strongly characterised by an interprofessional environment and that students are made aware of the importance of a respectful interaction with other professional healthcare professions early in their studies.

The expert group rates quality standard 1.03f as completely fulfilled.

Standard 1.03g) remain competitive on an international level.

Description

According to the self-assessment report, the study programme in chiropractic medicine in Switzerland is regarded as the role model for chiropractic education internationally because chiropractic medicine and human medicine share the same curriculum during the first four years and it is the only chiropractic programme in the world that takes 6 years to finish. This integration ensures the academic qualities of the incoming students by a vigorous selection

process that all candidates for medical, dental, veterinary and chiropractic study courses must submit to, candidates for human and chiropractic medicine having to meet identical entrance requirements. It also challenges their ability to 'endure' and complete an extensive (six full years) and very demanding course of study. An added benefit is the full integration into the clinical setting of the Orthopaedic University Hospital Balgrist with its many medical specialties.

Analysis

The expert group shares the opinion that the study programme in chiropractic medicine is a unique programme that has the potential to become a leading example for chiropractic education, clinical training and research on a global basis. There is significant evidence that the graduates of this study programme are very well prepared for clinical practice within a multidisciplinary healthcare setting and therefore remain competitive on an international level.

As the programme is only offered at the University of Zurich in Switzerland, there is no mobility within other Swiss universities. At present, there is also no cooperation established with other study programmes in chiropractic medicine in Europe or the rest of the world. According to the responsible persons for the study programme, cooperation nationally and internationally would be desirable but cannot be realised yet due to the language issues (German) and the specific structure of the curriculum.

The expert group rates quality standard 1.03g as completely fulfilled.

2nd area: Conception, architecture and structure of the study programme

Standard 2.01:

The study programme implements the respective learning objectives in a manner that allows the graduates to attain their educational objectives in accordance with MedPA.

Description

The programme uses the national catalogue of learning objectives LOCES I and, as of 2018, PROFILES as the basis for the definition of learning objectives that is geared towards the final competencies according to the MedPA. The national catalogue of learning objectives LOCES/PROFILES was differentiated into educational objectives per academic year and further into learning objectives per module and thematic block. One person from the lecturers is responsible for each thematic block. The courses in the thematic blocks are designed in lecture form or as practical courses in small groups, depending on the subject. The educational objectives of the clinical year (Year 6) are individually available for all students in the 'Logbook for the clinical year'.

Analysis

In the opinion of the expert group, on the basis of the findings of the visit and the self-assessment report, the learning objectives are available for the entire study programme and the application and implementation of the learning objectives in the study programme enables the achievement of the training objectives according to MedPA.

However, the expert group also noted that the implementation of PROFILES into the study programme of chiropractic medicine is not yet very advanced. First meetings with the Faculty of Medicine, which will provide support to the Department of Chiropractic Medicine in this matter, are scheduled for winter 2020. In view of the fact that the final examination will be based on PROFILES from 2022, the implementation of PROFILES for chiropractic medicine must now be accelerated in close collaboration with the Faculty of Medicine.

The expert panel rates quality standard 2.01 as largely fulfilled.

Recommendation:

The expert group recommends that the planned implementation of PROFILES into the study programme of chiropractic medicine is accelerated without hesitation to meet the 2022 deadline.

Standard 2.02:

Graduates of the study programme must demonstrate the following knowledge, skills and capabilities (adjusted in accordance with MedPA Art. 6):

a) possession of the scientific foundations required to perform preventive, diagnostic, therapeutic, palliative and rehabilitative care;

Description

Year 1 is devoted to the basics of natural and human sciences and Year 2 to basic medical knowledge and basic medical skills. These pre-clinical years set the basis for the science in the study programme, which is further developed in the clinical part of the study programme. For example, the following scientific basics are taught: experimental design, critical handling of data, statistics, data acquisition, evaluation and interpretation. Master's and doctoral theses can be written by students within the framework of larger research projects.

Analysis

The expert group notes that, in addition to teaching the scientific fundamentals at the beginning of the programme, the importance of evidence base is also taught at a later point in the programme when teaching clinical content. From this, the expert group concludes that the scientific foundations for preventive, diagnostic, therapeutic, palliative and rehabilitative measures are taught.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.02a as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.02b) an understanding of the principles and methods of scientific research;

Description

The principles and methods of scientific research are part of the special profile of the University of Zurich. In both the core and the mantle studies ('Mantelstudium'), various courses on scientific research are offered. These include courses on the thematic blocks 'Biostatistics and Knowledge Transfer', 'Methodology Medical Research', 'Data Analysis' and 'Evidence-Based Medicine'. An introduction to writing the master's thesis is given separately and at an early stage.

In Year 5, students attend a weekly course on current topics during which they discuss evidence-based research on relevant clinical topics. In Year 6, a monthly journal club is held where relevant articles are presented and discussed alternately by the research or clinical team (including underassistants). Additionally, a monthly research colloquium takes place, where underassistants present their completed master's theses.

Analysis

On the basis of the courses offered on the subject of scientific research and on the basis of the discussions held, the expert group finds that students are taught the ability to understand the principles and methods of scientific research.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.02b as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.02c) a recognition of the factors needed to maintain good health, the ability to evaluate and consider them in a professional capacity;

Description

All students complete an individual tutorial in a general practitioner practice in Year 3. In addition, students take courses in 'Active Rehabilitation', 'Ergonomics' as well as workshops in 'Nutrition' and 'Exercise Physiology' that were introduced recently in Year 5 of the chiropractic medicine curriculum. In addition, basic principles of psychosocial medicine, health promotion and prevention (public health) and epidemiology are taught.

Analysis

The expert group is of the opinion that the individual tutorial in general practitioner medicine and the other courses offered enable students to recognise, assess and consider health-preserving influences.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.02c as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.02d) the ability to advise, assist and support patients in cooperation with members of other professions;

Description

The Medical Faculty of the University of Zurich wants to make an active contribution to efficient interprofessional training and cooperation in the Swiss health care system and has therefore established the Vice-Dean of Interprofessionalism. In individual courses, students are given the opportunity for interprofessional learning with members of other health professions, for example, with physiotherapists in the fields of 'taping' or foot orthotics. A close interprofessional relationship with a multitude of health professions (orthopaedic surgery, rheumatology, internal medicine, neurology, physiotherapy, ergotherapy, orthopaedic technicians and nursing staff within Balgrist University Hospital) is furthered during the clinical rotation in the outpatient clinic in Year 6.

Analysis

The expert group notes that courses in the field of interprofessional teaching are already included in the curriculum, in which students can learn to advise, accompany and care for patients in cooperation with members of other professions. With the full implementation of PROFILES, even greater emphasis will be placed on this issue.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.02d as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.02e) the ability to analyse medical information and research results and make a critical assessment and application in a professional capacity;

Description

In various courses, knowledge about the structure of studies, critical questioning and philosophical backgrounds of medicine as a science are handled. During the clinical year (Year 6), students are given the opportunity for practical implementation.

Analysis

Based on the existing formats, the expert group concludes that the ability to analyse medical information and results of research and their critical evaluation and implementation in

professional activities is conveyed in the programme. The widespread implementation of PROFILES will lead to an even better evaluation of this standard in the future.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.02e as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.02f) the capacity to learn how to work in inter-professional collaboration with members of other professions;

Description

Joint learning with other health care professions has been implemented in a number of courses and is being further developed. The position of the Vice-Dean for Interprofessionalism was established for the purpose of content and strategic coordination. There is a close exchange with educational institutions located in the Zurich area.

Analysis

On the basis of the self-assessment report and the visit (many convincing examples were mentioned), the group of experts gained the impression that graduates of the study programme in chiropractic medicine are able to work interprofessionally in the context of joint patient care. As mentioned in Standard 1.03, the work of a chiropractor is strongly characterised by an interprofessional environment with a focus on patient-centred care, and students are made aware of the importance of a respectful interaction with other professional healthcare professions early in their studies.

The expert panel rates quality standard 2.02f as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.02g) a knowledge of the legal framework of the Swiss social insurance and healthcare systems and ability to apply that knowledge in a professional capacity;

Description

Courses in social and preventive medicine are compulsory for all students. Questions about the social security systems will also be raised in the context of the work in the policlinic during Year 6 (clinical year). Furthermore, several workshops about the Swiss health system are offered by a Swiss economist and an attorney.

Analysis

On the basis of the courses described and on the basis of the feedback from the discussions held during the visit, the expert group concludes that the students are qualified according to the standard. Furthermore, the expert group is of the opinion that these topics are also deepened during the post-graduate course, which appears to make sense. Of course, aspects of health economics could always be deepened further, but it is always necessary to find a good balance here and weigh up which content should be expanded in the already dense curriculum of the study programme in chiropractic medicine.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.02g as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.02h) the ability to assess the effectiveness, appropriateness and economic efficiency of their services and conduct themselves accordingly;

Description

In Year 6, all students have the opportunity to test the principle cited in the standard in practice. This is supported and documented by keeping a logbook. The effectiveness, appropriateness

and economic efficiency of the services are also discussed in various courses (e. g. family medicine and social and preventive medicine).

Analysis

It is crucial that graduates understand how new services are compensated and how the pricing mechanism for services by the authorities works. The expert group notes that students are given both the theoretical foundations and the opportunity to practise and subsequently analyse this in practice.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.02h as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.02i) an understanding of the relationship between the national economy and the healthcare system and its various care provision structures;

Description

The relationships between the national economy and the health system is explored as far as possible in the curriculum. Medical roles and their implication are discussed in Year 5 as part of the current topics in clinical chiropractic and clinical problem-solving lectures.

Analysis

The expert group was provided with sufficient evidence clearly showing that the topics addressed in the standard are anchored in the curriculum.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.02i as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.02j) an ability to apply their knowledge, skills and capabilities in a professional capacity and continuously build upon them.

Description

The goal of the Department of Chiropractic Medicine is to graduate students with the best clinical knowledge and skills as well as manual treatment skills of any international chiropractic programme. The fact that chiropractic students take all core courses leading to the B Med degree as well as Year 4 of the medical curriculum (Year 1 M Med) facilitates this goal. This early and relevant clinical exposure helps the students learn at a deeper level and remember common and less common conditions. Additionally, it supports their history-taking and examination skills on a wider variety of patients. Expanding upon the knowledge and skills obtained from the human medicine topics, the chiropractic students start developing their manual skills during the chiropractic elective courses starting in Year 1. These skills are continually developed and assessed throughout all 6 years of the academic programme.

At the end of the Year 4, a formative practical examination is conducted analogous to the practical examination in the federal examination. This examination is called OSCE, short for 'objective structured clinical examination'.

Furthermore, the logbook for Year 6 (clinical year) already contains parts for self-reflection (at the end of each rotation and at the end of the time spent in the polyclinic). Lifelong learning, personality development and self-care are addressed in Year 6, especially in the outpatient clinic rotation during rounds and different workshops.

Analysis

The expert group notes that, due to the design of the curriculum, all students are basically enabled to apply and extend their knowledge. Furthermore, the study programme in chiropractic

medicine also creates the awareness that chiropractors should continually update their knowledge until the end of their professional life.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.02j as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.03:

The study programme supports the development of social competence and students' character with a view to enabling them to meet the requirements of their future profession.

In particular, the study programme prepares students to:

a) recognise and respect the limits of the medical profession as well as their own strengths and weaknesses;

Description

The LOCES' General Objectives have been implemented at various points in the curriculum. The limits of medical activity, and especially the scope of practice of chiropractors, are addressed in different lectures and courses, often with direct reference to patients and in individual tutoring sessions during the outpatient clinic rotation.

Within the framework of the formative OSCE, students are given the opportunity to receive direct, individual feedback on their medical activities and their own strengths and weaknesses at the end of Year 4. Similar possibilities are offered by the various Mini-CEX during the clinical year. The logbook for the clinical year also includes self-reflection sections after each rotation and the time spent in the policlinic.

Analysis

The expert group is of the opinion that students in the programme are given sufficient opportunity to recognise and respect both their subjective and the limits of medical activity in general and also their own strengths and weaknesses. This means students learn when a problem is suitable for them to treat and when it is not (i.e. when they should refer on to other services). This is a central aspect to understanding the role of a chiropractor in the health care system. The acquisition of the competencies – as required by the standard – are considered by the expert group to be well anchored longitudinally in the study programme.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.03a as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.03b) understand the ethical dimension of their professional conduct and appreciate their responsibility towards individuals, society and the environment;

Description

The study programme includes courses in both the core and the mantle studies ('Mantelstudium') that deal with ethical issues (e.g. 'Fundamentals of Ethics in Medicine' (Year 1), 'Ethical Case Analyses'). In Year 5 and 6 of the Chiropractic Medicine curriculum, ethical topics and concerns are addressed in various courses and mostly performed on a one-to-one basis during the time spent in the policlinic.

Analysis

The curriculum includes a wide range of courses for dealing with and reflecting on ethical topics, which are embedded in various contexts that allow the students to learn and comprehend the socio-political dimension of medical care. Based on the corresponding courses, which are anchored longitudinally in the curriculum, the expert group concludes that students are enabled to understand the ethical dimension of their professional activities.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.03b as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.03c) uphold patients' rights of self-determination in the course of their treatment.

Description

The patients' right of self-determination is anchored in many courses. These are lectures and clinical courses in the thematic blocks, specifically in psychosocial medicine and psychiatry, in various mantle study modules and at the legal level in forensic medicine. Context-related experiences from the clinical year (Year 6) are regularly taken up and discussed.

Analysis

The right of patients' self-determination within the framework of treatment is repeatedly included and integrated into clinical situations and broadly anchored in the curriculum. The reviewers therefore conclude that the students are thus enabled, as required by the standard.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.03c as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.04:

The study programme sets the following educational objectives:

Graduates will

a) have knowledge of the fundamental structures and functional mechanisms of the human body as are relevant to the practice of the profession, from the molecular level to the organism as a whole, in all its developmental phases and covering the entire spectrum from healthy to diseased;

Description

In the core curriculum of Year 1, students are taught the biomedical basics. These basics are taught in close cooperation with lecturers from university hospitals. The integration of the information from the biomedical sciences into the clinical courses is critical for chiropractic medicine in order to understand the source of abnormal structure, function and diseases as well as their influence on treatment. This is particularly true for musculoskeletal anatomy, spinal anatomy, neuroanatomy, neurophysiology, biophysics and pathology. All of these topics are integrated into the chiropractic courses as much as possible.

Analysis

On the basis of the self-assessment report and the descriptions given during the visit, the expert group notes that biomedical basics are given much weight in the curriculum and that students receive a solid foundation at the beginning of their studies.

The expert panel group quality standard 2.04a as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.04b) be able to diagnose and treat common and urgent health problems and diseases that are treated in their professional field;

Description

The curriculum includes the treatment of clinical pictures in Year 3 and Year 4 of the study programme and their application in Year 5 and Year 6. In the field of emergency medicine, courses, internships and lectures are held throughout the entire course of study. Furthermore, PROFILES outline the common health conditions that a chiropractor should be able to manage.

Analysis

From the existing compulsory courses, which are located longitudinally throughout the entire study programme, the expert group concludes that the requirements of the standard are fulfilled.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.04b as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.04c) be able to handle medication in a professional, environmentally sound and economical manner;

Description

Chiropractors in Switzerland have a full right to handle medication. Courses on remedies are integrated in all thematic blocks throughout the curriculum. This is carried out in close cooperation with the Institute of Pharmacology and Toxicology at the University of Zurich and the Institute of Clinical Pharmacology at the University Hospital.

Furthermore, during Year 5, as part of the course 'Advanced Chiropractic Diagnosis and Technique', a 4-hour lecture on pharmacology and the use of medication relevant to the needs of chiropractors is held.

The reflected practical application of remedies takes place in the clinical year under supervision and is specifically discussed in case of concrete ambiguities.

Analysis

The expert group welcomes the fact that contents on remedies are integrated in all thematic blocks and that there is close cooperation with the corresponding institutes.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.04c as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.04d) recognise diseases patterns relevant to related professional fields and adapt their approach to the overriding problems;

Description

Individual, interprofessional courses are held throughout the curriculum. The Faculty of Medicine of the University of Zurich has also appointed a Vice-Dean's Office for Interprofessionalism with the aim of expanding this area in the curriculum.

Analysis

On the basis of clinical pictures, students are introduced to the limits of their own professional field and to the necessity of involving specialists from other health care professions. In addition, the practical application of the knowledge acquired during the course of study is encouraged in the clinical year (Year 6). The expert group assesses the existing courses as sufficient and at the same time welcomes the existing plans and intentions of the Faculty of Medicine to expand the area of interprofessional learning for all students.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.04d as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.04e) be able to summarise and communicate findings and their interpretation;

Description

The interpretation and communication of findings is a key medical competence that is practised and checked at various stages in the curriculum. Teaching formats for this are the 'Introductory Course Clinical Medicine', the clinical courses in general, the formative OSCE examination

before the start of Year 5, the clinic entrance exam at the end of Year 5 and the workplace-based assessments as well as the lectures and workshops in the clinical year.

The subject of communication is dealt with in a structured way in courses in all academic years. Building on basic principles, special situations and telephone counselling are discussed.

Analysis

The expert group notes that the theoretical basics are taught and the ability to communicate is practised in order to summarise and communicate findings. This point was not elaborated further during the visit.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.04e as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.04f) understand health problems holistically and grasp in particular the physical, psychological, social, legal, economic, cultural and environmental factors and impacts, and incorporate these in solving health problems at the individual and community level;

Description

Students in Year 1 are taught the basics of natural and human sciences and, in Year 2, basic knowledge of medicine and basic medical skills. The understanding of health problems is the subject of Years 3 and 4 of the study programme. In Year 5 and Year 6, students have the opportunity to deepen their knowledge of certain topics throughout the entire programme. An important element in the curriculum is the role-model function of the lecturers in all lectures in the clinical courses and the supervisors in the clinical year.

Analysis

In relation to this standard, the expert group refers to the available information within the structure of the study programme and its basis on the LOCES/PROFILES, which was addressed earlier in this report. The experts consider this to be the ideal prerequisite for understanding health problems holistically as required by the standard. Furthermore, managing all aspects of a patient's problem(s) is an integral part of the subjects that teach management and is also central to the clinical year.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.04f as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.04g) understand patients as individuals and within their social environment, and address their concerns as well as those of their relatives;

Description

Dealing with patients and their relatives is dealt with longitudinally throughout the entire study programme in the field of communication. In lectures, clinical courses and the clinical year, students experience very different role models that they can reflect upon.

Analysis

The expert group is of the opinion that the theoretical foundations and the possibilities for practical exercise are given in the study programme. Students learn the consistent inclusion of patients and their empowerment for self-competence as well as the focus on the individual patient. Furthermore, managing all aspects of a patient's problem(s), not only their presenting problem, is an integral part of the subjects that teach management and is also central to the clinical year.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.04g as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.04h) show a commitment to human health by providing advice and taking the necessary preventative and health-promoting measures in their professional field;

Description

In the field of social and preventative medicine, various courses are offered in the curriculum. All students are given the opportunity for practical training in the individual tutorials 'General Practitioner Medicine' in Year 3 of the study programme. Preventative and health-promoting measures are also informally reflected in clinical courses and the clinical year (Year 6).

Analysis

Students deepen and expand their medical knowledge and skills particularly during the clinical year (Year 6). This is achieved by operating in an advisory capacity. Under supervision, they take preventative and health-promoting measures in the in- and outpatient sector. Furthermore, managing all aspects of a patient's problem(s) is an integral part of the subjects that teach management and is also central to the clinical year.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.04h as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.04i) respect the dignity and autonomy of each person, possess knowledge of ethical reasoning methods, be familiar with the ethical problems in their professional field, and be guided in their professional and scientific activities by ethical principles that serve the common good;

Description

Medical ethics is taught and treated at various points during the course of study.

Analysis

The expert group notes that sufficient courses are offered longitudinally in the field of ethics.

(see also standard 2.03b.)

The expert group rates quality standard 2.04i as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.04j) have an appropriate level of knowledge of complementary medicine methods and therapeutic approaches;

Description

Complementary medicine is anchored in the curriculum of the University of Zurich, partly in the core curriculum and partly in the mantle study ('Mantelstudium'). In its self-assessment report regarding complementary medicine, the Department of Chiropractic Medicine refers to the thematic blocks on blood and neoplasia, hyperlipidaemia and diabetes, circulatory diseases, transmitted diseases, and osteoporosis as well as the comprehensive study programme on complementary medicine, which is not obligatory for all students.

Analysis

The expert group is of the opinion that the existing offer is sufficient due to the existing courses in the area of complementary medicine that are located in the core and also in the mantle studies ('Mantelstudium'). Nevertheless, a large part of the current offer is located in the mantle studies and is therefore not obligatory for chiropractic students. From the available documents and the discussion during the visit, the expert group could not determine whether the most important complementary medicine methods are imparted to the chiropractic students and, therefore, formulates a corresponding recommendation.

The expert panel rates quality standard 2.04j as largely fulfilled.

Recommendation:

The expert group recommends that the Faculty of Medicine checks whether adequate knowledge of the five complementary medicine methods TCM, acupuncture, homeopathy, anthroposophy and phytotherapy is imparted in the core curriculum and is therefore compulsory for all students.

Standard 2.04k) be familiar with the role of the various experts in the primary care setting and know the central importance and function of general practice medicine.

Description

Among others, the Institute of General Practice offers various courses and seminars in this field. While a lecture is held in Year 1, all students complete corresponding individual tutorials in Year 3. This is followed in Year 4 by a thematic block 'Medicine of the Elderly' and a clinical course 'Family Medicine'. Cooperation with specialists from other health care professions is described in the standards 1.03f, 2.02d and 2.02f.

Analysis

On the basis of the described courses, which are offered longitudinally throughout the entire study programme, and the feedback received during the visit, the expert group concludes that the requirements of the standard are fulfilled.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.04k as completely fulfilled

Standard 2.05:
The study programme is reviewed regularly to determine how the general objectives of MedPA are being implemented in light of new challenges and conditions in the professional field and how the requirements for the necessary training are being fulfilled.

Description

According to the self-assessment report, the human medicine courses as well as the chiropractic medicine courses at the University of Zurich are regularly reviewed by various committees for new challenges and changing conditions in the professional field. The main committees are the monthly Conference of Deans of Studies, the meetings of the Faculty Board and the Faculty Assembly as well as the curriculum committee.

The official evaluation procedure of the single courses is first carried out through the deanery of the Medical Faculty, which also takes the chiropractic courses for the full length of the curriculum into account.

Another important source for quality assurance is the direct feedback from students. A focus group, which includes one representative from each year of study, meets with the Curriculum Director of the study programme in chiropractic medicine at the end of each semester and summarises the feedback given by all the students.

The examination results, the results of the student evaluations, the focus group discussions between students and Deans of Studies and the survey of graduates by the Federal Statistical Office are discussed and used to further develop the study programme.

In addition, the study programme is subjected to an external quality assurance review by means of accreditation every seven years, which includes examining the training for its compatibility with the Medical Professions Act.

Analysis

There are both internal and external reviews of how the programme implements the general objectives of the MedPA in view of the challenges and conditions in the professional field.

However, all internal evaluations only focus on individual parts of the programme (e.g. course-evaluation) and do not address the entire study programme. From the point of view of the expert group, it would be necessary to review the entire study programme of chiropractic medicine on a regular basis. This would also improve the currently only informally established exchange between the Curriculum Directors responsible for the study programme in human medicine and the Curriculum Director for the study programme in chiropractic medicine. A closer collaboration would be of great benefit and in the best interest for the further development of the chiropractic medicine curriculum.

(see also standard 4.02).

The expert group rates quality standard 2.05 as largely fulfilled.

Recommendation:

The expert group recommends that the Faculty of Medicine together with the Department of Chiropractic Medicine evaluate the study programme in chiropractic medicine on a regular basis, taking all of the six academic years of study into account.

Standard 2.06:

It is documented that all applicable regulations in Switzerland for the professional qualifications of graduates are taken into consideration in the study programme.

Description/Analysis

The study programme in chiropractic medicine is determined by regulations according to the guidelines of the University of Zurich (Studienordnung für das Bachelor- und Masterstudium an der Medizinischen Fakultät der Universität Zürich). Overall, the study programme is subject to the requirements of the Medical Professions Act and is geared towards the final federal examination. The valid guidelines on professional qualifications are published on the website of the Medical Faculty.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.06 as completely fulfilled.

Standard 2.07:

The methods of assessing the performance of students is adapted to the learning objectives.

Description

The examination of cognitive learning objectives is mainly carried out by summative multiple choice (MC) tests and the practical learning objectives are tested in appropriate practical formats. MC tests take place at the end of each semester (Year 1 to Year 4) and at the end of the autumn semester of Year 6 of the study programme. The examination of practical skills and abilities takes place after Year 2 (oral practical examination), Year 4 (in the format of an OSCE) and during the practical year (as Mini-CEX and self-assessment). The focus in the practical year is on workplace-based assessment and at least one workplace-based assessment (e.g. Mini-CEX) per internship is documented in a logbook in addition to self-assessments of clinical practical skills and medical roles. Presentation skills are tested within the framework of various mantle study modules whereas scientific competences are assessed within the framework of the master's thesis.

Analysis

The expert group has noted that the assessment system is basically made up of different didactical types of tests. However, they have also learned from the report and especially in the interviews that special attention should be paid to the oral exams of Year 2 because of the particular difficulty of designing such examinations with sufficient reliability. Above all, there appears to be a lack of feedback for students who did not pass this exam.

According to those responsible for the chiropractic curriculum, MC tests are avoided whenever possible for their course and supplemented by other more useful examination formats (e.g. Mini-CEX, short-essay questions).

Furthermore, the expert group perceives the examination formats OSCE and Mini-CEX very positively because they are oriented towards competences and represent a constancy regarding post-graduate education where the same examination formats are used. Additionally, written assessment formats such as short-essay questions are also used to assess conditional and strategic knowledge of students related to relevant problems in clinical practice.

Nevertheless, the experts note that a 'constructive alignment' in the sense of alignment between learning objectives, teaching strategies and assessment methods is not apparent in the documentation. With the introduction of PROFILES and the transition to the EPAs, the constructive alignment becomes even more important and the assessment methods should be further developed and documented.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.07 as largely fulfilled.

Recommendation:

The expert group recommends that the Department of Chiropractic Medicine document the constructive alignment of learning objectives, teaching strategies and assessment methods.

Standard 2.08:

The admission requirements and requirements for earning a qualification are regulated and published.

Description

Admission to the study programme in chiropractic medicine at the University of Zurich is regulated by the Numerus Clausus. The number of study places – currently 24 – is defined each year by a resolution of the Government Council. This is transparently displayed on the website of the Faculty of Medicine. The implementation of the Numerus Clausus lies in the responsibility of swiss universities. The conditions for the acquisition of the degree can be found in the 'Studienordnung für das Bachelor- und Masterstudium an der Medizinischen Fakultät der Universität Zürich' on the website of the Faculty of Medicine.

Analysis

Students for the study programme in chiropractic medicine are selected under exactly the same rules and regulations that apply to human medicine students. The conditions for successful completion of the Bachelor's and Master's in Chiropractic Medicine are regulated in the respective regulations issued by the Faculty of Medicine, approved by the University Council and published online. The submitted documentation provides full evidence for this standard.

The expert group rates quality standard 2.08 as completely fulfilled.

3rd area: Implementation

Standard 3.01:

The study programme is offered regularly.

Description/ Analysis

Since 2008, the study programme in chiropractic medicine has been offered regularly. It is possible to begin in the autumn semester, provided that the admission requirements are met.

The expert group rates quality standard 3.01 as completely fulfilled.

Standard 3.02:

The available resources (supervision and material resources) enable students to attain their learning objectives. The higher education institution describes how the number of students is determined in all phases of the curriculum and to what extent it is adjusted to meet the capacity of the training institution.

Description

The available resources for the study programme in chiropractic medicine are matched to the learning objectives in that there is an intensive annual planning phase in conjunction with budget planning. For this purpose, all relevant people from the Department of Chiropractic Medicine are involved in the discussion. The planning is the responsibility of the Head of Study Programme Chiropractic Medicine.

The chiropractic medicine programme has no full-time employees. All faculty and staff are employed part time. Currently, the administration of the programme and the policlinic consists of the Head of the Department with a 25% employment, the Curriculum Director with 20% employment and the Directors of the Policlinic with 15% employment. In addition, the department employs one assistant to the department with 80% employment.

Currently, there are 13 professionals teaching specifically on the B Med (Schwerpunkt Chiropraktik)/M Chiro Med course. The M Chiro Med faculty (not including the clinic supervisors) is made up of 8 chiropractors, 3 medical doctors, 2 physiotherapists with advanced degrees and 2 experienced radiographers. Other than the radiographers, all but four faculty members hold a dual qualification including 1 DC/MD, 1 DC/Master's in Medical Education, 1 PT/Master's in Manipulative Physiotherapy, 1 PT/PhD and 2 DC/PT qualifications.

The student-teacher-ratio for practical classes varies by size of the student intake but is never more than one faculty member per 16 students. As students pair up for practical classes, each faculty member will mentor a maximum of 8 pairs. If the class size exceeds 12 -16 students, teaching assistants are employed to improve the supervision in the practical classes.

The Policlinic Faculty consist of 2 Clinic Directors who share the overall running of the clinic, the educational responsibilities and patient care along with 6 additional Clinic Supervisors, each working 1/2 day per week. The underassistants and supervisors practise along with the Head of Department and three clinical fellows working part time. Seven chiropractors are also available and trained who serve as replacement clinicians for holidays and sick leave. There is a good mix of male and female supervisors and all have extensive clinical experience and have completed the 3-year post-graduate programme.

For chiropractic medicine, the maximum number of students admitted to the programme is currently 24 per year as determined by the Faculty of Medicine University Council. This number has increased from 22 in 2018. In 2020, only 15 candidates qualified for a place of study in the first year.

In order to promote recruitment to the chiropractic medicine programme, ChiroSuisse has increased its promotional activities since 2018 and begun an advertising campaign targeting young people in their final year of Gymnasium (high school). Chiropractors in private practice are encouraged to assist in recruiting suitable prospective students from their patient population. For this process, ChiroSuisse has created new PR material.

The Department of Chiropractic Medicine has its own teaching facilities that are located at Balgrist Hospital. There are currently 7 treatment rooms and one supervision room available; other rooms (e.g. lounge) are not available for students at the hospital.

Analysis

For all courses of study offered by the Medical Faculty, including chiropractic medicine, the admission requirements and the admission restrictions are regulated and published on the website of the University of Zurich. Every year, at the request of the Education Directorate, the Government Council determines the number of study places for medical studies. The admission restrictions apply to both bachelor's and master's levels and are regulated in the Ordinance on Admission Restrictions to Medical Courses at the University of Zurich. An increase in the study place capacity is based on a precise analysis of the resources required by and allocated to the Faculty of Medicine. Beyond the admission restriction, a place can generally only be allocated if the admission requirements in accordance with the Ordinance on Admission to Studies and, in particular, the country-specific admission requirements for studies at bachelor level are met. Students are admitted into the chiropractic medicine programme under exactly the same rules and regulations that apply to human medicine. In the opinion of the expert group, the way in which study places are determined is regulated and transparent.

According to oral statements during the visit, many students change to the human medicine study programme after Year 4, which leads to small cohorts in Year 5 and 6 of the chiropractic study programme. During the visit, it remained unclear how many students actually transfer to human medicine as no concrete numbers were presented and no precise monitoring was available for closer scrutiny. However, the Department of Chiropractic Medicine can do nothing about these changes, which are partly tactically motivated. Some students also find that they would prefer to delve into another medical discipline. Based on the situation as presented in the self-assessment report and in the discussions during the visit, the expert group states that, at the time of the accreditation, the resources in terms of materials, technical equipment and supervision are tight but sufficient.

Furthermore, they also note that the Chair of Chiropractic Medicine is still vacant although the Medical Faculty has been made aware and their efforts to recruit the position are apparent. They have been looking for a person who meets the high standards that the Faculty of Medicine sets for all appointments for professors. As the number of eligible persons is limited, the efforts have remained fruitless so far. However, it became clear in the discussions that the faculty is committed to filling the chair in the months to come.

Furthermore, the Head of Study Programme will retire soon. Negotiations on how the succession should look are planned for the coming weeks and different options are under discussion, which were briefly touched upon during the visit (e.g. the current Head of Study Programme is still available on a mandate basis). Due to confidentiality, not all possible options are mentioned here. Although the issue will be negotiated in the coming weeks, the succession – apart from oral statements – could not be documented.

In addition, it is obviously very difficult to find suitable staff who want to get involved in the study programme in chiropractic medicine. Therefore, many people only have a very limited employment record. It would be desirable for the future to have more full-time employees in

order to give the programme stability with respect to key teaching staff. Moreover, the expert group was not able to clarify what the resource situation would be like if all 24 study places were filled.

The expert group rates quality standard 3.02 as largely fulfilled.

Recommendations:

The expert group recommends that the Department of Chiropractic Medicine clearly documents the plans for physical and staffing resources for larger cohorts of students (24).

The expert group recommends that the Department of Chiropractic Medicine outlines a succession plan for the position of the Head of Study Programme and Policlinic for Chiropractic Medicine (due to imminent retirement).

Standard 3.03:

The teaching staff possesses the competencies appropriate to the special features of the study programme and its objectives.

Description

The Faculty of Medicine offers a specific medical didactics programme together with the UZH's Continuing Education and University Didactics departments. It includes lecturer training ('Début', 'Orientation Afternoon for New Lecturers at the Faculty of Medicine', 'Basic Teacher Training Course for Habilitation Candidates') as well as examiner training for OSCE and the practical part of the federal examination. The Institute for General and Family Medicine and the Clinic for Psychosocial Medicine of the University Hospital Zurich offer their own training formats specific to teaching events.

Analysis

The experience, skills and qualifications of staff and faculty linked to the study programme in chiropractic medicine are wholly adequate. Nevertheless, the expert group strongly encourage the staff to regularly participate in the broad range of free pedagogical courses offered at UZH to further their teaching competences.

The expert group rates quality standard 3.03 as completely fulfilled.

Standard 3.04:

The training institution pursues a long-term policy to promote young talent, which includes continuing education and training, development and assessment of the teaching staff. The criteria applied here takes into consideration research performance as well as teaching qualifications.

Description

The Faculty of Medicine offers a specific medical didactic programme. In addition, the teaching staff of the Faculty of Medicine have free access to the university-wide programme for lecturers.

The chiropractic medicine staff members are invited to attend and participate in the various free courses provided by the University of Zurich as mentioned in the section above. Furthermore, ChiroSuisse requires 80 hours per year of continuing education (CE) credits and this is monitored through the Swiss Chiropractic Academy located in Bern. A committee consisting of 3 chiropractors/chiropractic educators determine which courses are worthy of post-graduate CE credits.

Analysis

Basically, it is very difficult for the study programme to find new recruits or young talents who want to pursue an academic career. The new generation of academics can only be formed by former students of the study programme in chiropractic medicine. There are only a few graduates and the majority of them would prefer to practice in clinic first instead of working in the education sector. Furthermore, no recognition of meritorious performance of the faculty and staff of chiropractic medicine has occurred to date by the University of Zurich. This may be due to the fact that, in the eyes of the Medical Faculty, the qualification as a chiropractor with a professional doctorate from a US or Canadian educational institution does not constitute equivalence to a UZH master's degree and, therefore, chiropractors educated abroad (which includes all chiropractors graduating before 2014) are virtually excluded from acquiring academic qualifications. This makes the situation even more difficult for the promotion of young talent.

Nevertheless, the promotion of young talents is an important issue for the Department of Chiropractic Medicine. During the visit, several good examples were presented by junior staff (e.g. PhD students) who are currently in the process of further academic qualification. These people confirmed that the resources provided to them are very good and that they are well supported.

Finally, the expert group felt assured that, on the basis of policy, there are ample opportunities available throughout the university for academic staff, members of faculty and researchers to attend and be supported for appropriate staff development. Furthermore, development opportunities external to the university are available (e.g. continuing education through ChiroSuisse). A number of relevant examples have been outlined within the self-assessment report.

The expert group rates quality standard 3.04 as completely fulfilled.

4th area: Quality assurance

Standard 4.01:
Managing the study programme takes into consideration the interests of the relevant interest groups and makes it possible to achieve the necessary developments.

Description

In its self-assessment report, the Faculty of Medicine discloses transparently how the various stakeholders are taken into account. Within the faculty, the broad-based membership of the Teaching Commission should be emphasised in particular. The focus group discussions are appreciated by all sides. These discussions take place at the end of each semester between the Dean's Office and, for each cohort, a group of students recruited from the Education Commission of the Student Association. The discussions offer students the opportunity to give constructive feedback to the Dean's Office on a wide variety of topics in the most direct way possible.

Analysis

In the various discussions, the expert group has learned that the focus group meetings are a universally appreciated and established element in quality assurance, and that consequences and measures are derived from the students' feedback. Furthermore, during the visit, the expert group could convince themselves that there are many other stakeholders included in the development of the study programme.

The expert group rates quality standard 4.01 as completely fulfilled.

Standard 4.02:

The study programme is an integral component of the quality assurance system of the higher education institution or other institution within the higher education sector.

Description

UZH centrally provides quality assurance instruments for its study programmes that enable a multidimensional analysis of individual courses, modules and study programmes and serve as a basis for the comprehensive further development of quality in teaching and study.

The Teaching Commission plays a central role in this process. Here, information about the further development of the study programme is discussed on a regular basis and adjustments to the study programme are decided.

At the time of accreditation of the chiropractic course, the University of Zurich is in the process of establishing a quality management system for study and teaching based on existing measures. These measures are the monitoring of studies and teaching, the graduate survey of the Federal Statistical Office and the course assessment. This results in a quality index for study and teaching, on the basis of which annual talks are held between the faculty and students, between the faculty and lecturers and between the faculty and programme managers. The annual quality discussions between university management and faculty management are in turn based on this index.

Analysis

During the visit, the expert group raised the question of why no representative of the Department of Chiropractic Medicine is a member of the Teaching Commission. The answer was that not everyone could be a member. This situation is not acceptable to the expert group. The study programme in chiropractic medicine is a separate medical study programme that shares a large common part with the study programme in human medicine and, because of the shared parts, it is so important that the Department of Chiropractic Medicine is part of the Teaching Commission. To ensure the integration of the study programme in chiropractic medicine into the quality system of the University of Zurich and in order to improve the link of the Department of Chiropractic Medicine to the Faculty of Medicine, also with regard to organisational and communication issues (e. g. overlap of courses), a representative of the Department of Chiropractic Medicine must – from now on – be formally integrated (not on a volunteer basis) in the Teaching Commission and the monthly meeting of the study deans.

The expert group rates quality standard 4.02 as partially fulfilled.

Condition 1:

A representative of the Department of Chiropractic Medicine must be formally integrated (not on a voluntary basis) into the Teaching Commission and the monthly meetings of the study deans.

Standard 4.03:

The training institution reviews regularly the results of the students (including the federal examination) and documents the consequent implications for the study programme.

Description

The results of the federal examination are first analysed and discussed by the Curriculum Director within the Department of Chiropractic Medicine, the Directors of the Policlinic and the Head of Study Programme and Policlinic together with a member of the examination commission. The results are then distributed to the teaching staff. Individual interviews are sought with candidates who have failed in order to provide possibilities for support. If the results

suggest relevant curricular changes, the Curriculum Director, in consultation with the Directors of the Policlinic and the Head of Study Programme and Policlinic, initiates the necessary steps with the respective teaching staff.

The results in the course of the individual academic year (here, Years 1 to 4) are also recorded and analysed within the Dean's Office and the Dean's Conference.

Analysis

The expert group notes that the students' results are regularly reviewed and discussed. Any necessary improvements are implemented using defined processes.

The expert panel rates quality standard 4.03 as completely fulfilled.

3 Overall appraisal and strengths/weaknesses profile of the study programme

According to the expert group, the study programme in chiropractic medicine is characterised by a unique, strong and gradually evolving curriculum allowing complete integration of education between chiropractic and human medicine. The planned introduction of PROFILES to replace LOCES I and the clear orientation towards competences will further stimulate the study programme in chiropractic medicine. Furthermore, the students are very enthusiastic and dedicated to the study programme even though there are signs of curriculum overload, with additional subjects and exams compared to the students of human medicine. The clinical experience that is anchored longitudinally in the study programme in chiropractic medicine allows exposure to a variety of conditions and a complex patient population in the Balgrist Hospital. The quality, background and willingness to engage in education by all staff, even though many of them have only part-time contracts, is impressive. In the past years, the Department of Chiropractic Medicine has managed to establish a dedicated and growing research department and, considering the small size of the department, this needs to be commended. In addition, successful collaborative research activities with well-established teams at the Faculty of Medicine are growing, which has been recognised and appraised by the expert group. Finally, the study programme in chiropractic medicine as well as the Department of Chiropractic Medicine receives strong engagement and support from ChiroSuisse, which is very committed to the study programme and supports the department by attracting more chiropractic students through targeted advertising.

However, the expert group points out that the still vacant post of the Chair of Chiropractic Medicine should be filled as soon as possible and more full-time staff should be employed to stabilise and develop the study programme in the coming years. Furthermore, a succession plan for the Head of Study Programme and Policlinic for Chiropractic Medicine should be outlined due to imminent retirement. The aim of the study programme of the Department of Chiropractic Medicine is to fill all available places in the next few years so that 24 students graduate each year and Switzerland has access to more excellently trained and highly sought-after chiropractors. Therefore, the department should clearly document the plans for physical and staffing resources for larger cohorts of students. Finally, communication between the Faculty of Medicine and the Department of Chiropractic Medicine should be strengthened with regards to quality assurance and further development of the study programme. Therefore, a representative of the study programme must – from now on – participate regularly in the Teaching Commission and the monthly meetings of the study deans.

4 Recommendations for development of the study programme

- The expert group recommends that the planned implementation of PROFILES into the study programme of chiropractic medicine is accelerated without hesitation to meet the 2022 deadline.
- The expert group recommends that the Faculty of Medicine checks whether adequate knowledge of the five complementary medicine methods TCM, acupuncture, homeopathy, anthroposophy and phytotherapy is imparted in the core curriculum and is therefore compulsory for all students.
- The expert group recommends that the Faculty of Medicine together with the Department of Chiropractic Medicine evaluate the study programme in chiropractic medicine on a regular basis, taking all of the six academic years of study into account.
- The expert group recommends that the Department of Chiropractic Medicine document the constructive alignment of learning objectives, teaching strategies and assessment methods.
- The expert group recommends that the Department of Chiropractic Medicine clearly documents the plans for physical and staffing resources for larger cohorts of students (24).
- The expert group recommends that the Department of Chiropractic Medicine outlines a succession plan for the position of the Head of Study Programme and Policlinic for Chiropractic Medicine (due to imminent retirement).

5 Accreditation proposal of the expert panel

On the basis of the self-assessment report of the study programme in chiropractic medicine at the University of Zurich dated 31.03.2020 and the on-site visit of 15.10.2020 and 16.10.2020, the expert panel proposes that a formal pronouncement should be made to grant accreditation of the study programme in chiropractic medicine of the University of Zurich subject to the following condition.

- A representative of the Department of Chiropractic Medicine must be formally integrated (not on a voluntary basis) into the Teaching Commission and the monthly meetings of the study deans.



Part D

Statement of the University of Zurich

08.01.2021





UZH, Faculty of Medicine, Pestalozzistrasse 3/5, CH-8091 Zurich

AAQ
Swiss agency of accreditation and quality assurance
Effingerstrasse 15
P.O. Box
CH-3007 Bern

Prof. em. Dr. Rainer Weber
Dean
Telephone +41 44 634 10 71
rainer.weber@uzh.ch

Dr. Daniel Mühlemann
Head Chiropractic Medicine
Telephone +41 44 386 57 01
daniel.muehlemann@balgrist.ch

Zurich, 8. January 2021 / sa

Commentary to the External Evaluation Report regarding the Accreditation of the study program in Chiropractic Medicine, University of Zurich

Dear members of the AAQ

We would like to thank you for preparing the comprehensive External Evaluation Report (EER) regarding the Accreditation of the study program in Chiropractic Medicine, which was sent to UZH for factual verification on November 13, 2020.

After a thorough review, we found a few factual errors, which we have commented on in a separate document. In addition, we have implemented the request, which is to have chiropractic representatives participate on the teaching committee and in the monthly meetings of the study deans. In detail, the implementation looks as follows:

- **Monthly meetings of the study deans**

In consultation with Dr. Daniel Mühlemann, Chiropractic Medicine will be represented by Dr. Inga Paravicini, MME and Ms. Melanie Häusler, M chiro med, cand MME with immediate effect. The first monthly meeting with the participation of Chiropractic Medicine took place on October 26, 2020.

- **Teaching committee**

The Organizational Regulations of the Faculty of Medicine provide for the participation of Chiropractic Medicine on the Teaching Committee, which convenes twice a year. In consultation with Dr. Mühlemann, Ms. Melanie Häusler, M chiro med, cand MME will represent Chiropractic Medicine on this committee and will be invited to attend the next meeting in May 2021.



We are pleased to note that the experts have not expressed any concerns. However, we would like to point out that the following assessment in the report was rather harsh:

...the self-evaluation report was in part poorly written, contained much repetition, provided little meaningful information on the Chiropractic Medicine study programme, in part did not refer to the standards and essential appendices such as the curriculum for Year 5 and Year 6 were missing...

The AAQ had explicitly emphasized that the report should cover the entire course of study, including the four years of medical school. We found this task to be challenging because we had to rely on the 2018 self-evaluation report for the specifics of human medicine. Had we been able to focus exclusively on the chiropractic portion, the report would have been more coherent and also more detailed.

Apart from this comment, we find the EER to be very accurate and would like to commend the expert team for their thorough work. Their comments and suggestions are very much appreciated and will contribute substantially to the improvement of our study program.

Sincerely,



Dr. Daniel Mühleemann
Head Chiropractic Medicine



Prof. em. Dr. Rainer Weber
Dean

- Enclosure: Document with comments and amendments to the EER



Part E

Hearing of the Commission for Medical Professions

09.02.2021



Schweizerische Eidgenossenschaft
Confédération suisse
Confederazione Svizzera
Confederaziun svizra

Eidgenössisches Departement des Innern EDI

Medizinalberufekommission MEBEKO
Ressort Ausbildung

CH-3003 Bern, BAG **A-Priority**

Schweizerische Agentur für Akkreditierung
und Qualitätssicherung (aaq)
Effingerstrasse 15
Postfach
3001 Bern

Referenz/Aktenzeichen:
Ihr Zeichen:
Unser Zeichen: Ne
Liebefeld, 09. Februar 2021

Akkreditierung des Studienganges Chiropraktik an der medizinischen Fakultät der Universität Zürich

Sehr geehrte Damen und Herren

Im Namen der Medizinalberufekommission (MEBEKO), Ressort Ausbildung, wird wie folgt Stellung genommen:

1. Rechtsgrundlagen der Akkreditierung:
 - Nach Artikel 12 Absatz 1 Buchstabe b des Bundesgesetzes über die universitären Medizinalberufe (Medizinalberufegesetz, MedBG, SR 811.11) erhalten namentlich diejenigen Personen Zutritt zur eidgenössischen Prüfung einer der universitären Medizinalberufe, die einen nach dem MedBG akkreditierten Studiengang absolviert haben.
 - Die Artikel 23 und 24 MedBG regeln die Akkreditierungspflicht und die Akkreditierungskriterien. Die Studiengänge müssen nach den Anforderungen des Hochschulförderungs- und Koordinationsgesetz (HFKG, SR 414.20) und des MedBG akkreditiert sein. Die anzuwendenden Qualitätsstandards sind entsprechend eine Kombination der Anforderungen dieser beiden gesetzlichen Grundlagen. Das Verfahren richtet sich nach Artikel 32 HFKG. Nach Artikel 19 der Verordnung des Hochschulrates über die Akkreditierung im Hochschulbereich (Akkreditierungsverordnung HFKG, SR 414.205.3) gilt die Akkreditierung für sieben Jahre ab Akkreditierungsentscheid.
2. Aufgaben und Vorgehen der MEBEKO, Ressort Ausbildung, im Akkreditierungsprozess:
 - Nach Artikel 50 Absatz 1 MedBG kommen der MEBEKO im Bereich der Akkreditierung zwei Aufgaben zu. Sie berät verschiedene Gremien (darunter auch das Akkreditierungsorgan) in



Fragen der Aus- und Weiterbildung (Buchstabe a). Die MEBEKO nimmt zudem Stellung zu Akkreditierungsanträgen im Bereich der Aus- und Weiterbildung (Buchstabe b). Das Ressort Ausbildung der MEBEKO ist für die Akkreditierungsverfahren betreffend Ausbildungsgänge, das Ressort Weiterbildung der MEBEKO ist für diejenigen hinsichtlich Weiterbildungsgänge zuständig. Die Stellungnahme der MEBEKO, Ressort Ausbildung erfolgt nach Erhalt des Berichtsentwurfs des Akkreditierungsorgans, welcher auf der Beurteilung der Selbst- und Fremdevaluation beruht.

- Jeweils zwei Mitglieder der MEBEKO, Ressort Ausbildung, bereiten gestützt auf sämtliche Dokumente der Selbst- und Fremdevaluation (inklusive Expertenvision) sowie des Berichtsentwurfs des Akkreditierungsorgans die Diskussionen der Kommission vor. Sie berichten der Kommission schriftlich und mündlich und schlagen ihr eine Stellungnahme vor.
3. Die MEBEKO, Ressort Ausbildung, stellt fest, dass das Akkreditierungsverfahren des Studienganges Chiropraktik an der medizinischen Fakultät der Universität Zürich korrekt nach den geltenden Rechtsgrundlagen und Standards durchgeführt worden ist.
4. Stellungnahme der MEBEKO, Ressort Ausbildung, bezüglich Akkreditierung des Studienganges Chiropraktik an der medizinischen Fakultät der Universität Zürich:
- Der Selbstevaluationsbericht und der Expertenbericht aaq werden zustimmend zur Kenntnis genommen.
 - Die Beurteilung des Studienganges Chiropraktik an der medizinischen Fakultät der Universität Zürich durch die Experten ist für die MEBEKO nachvollziehbar und plausibel. Er empfiehlt eine Akkreditierung mit einer bereits erfüllten Auflage (formelle Integration einer Vertretung des Studienganges Chiropraktik in der Lehrkommission).
 - Die MEBEKO unterstützt die Empfehlung der Experten, den Studiengang Chiropraktik an der medizinischen Fakultät der Universität Zürich nach der bereits erfüllten Auflage ohne weitere Auflagen zu akkreditieren.

Freundliche Grüsse

Medizinalberufekommission
Ressort Ausbildung
Die Leiterin

Frau Dr.med. Nathalie Koch

AAQ
Effingerstrasse 15
P.O. Box
CH-3001 Bern

www.aaq.ch

